

SEC.GAL/14/08  
23 January 2008

ENGLISH only



**Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe**

**Office of the Secretary General**  
*Section for External Co-operation*



**2007 OSCE Mediterranean Seminar**  
**“Combating Intolerance and Discrimination**  
**and Promoting Mutual Respect and**  
**Understanding”, Tel Aviv Israel, 18 -**  
**19 December 2007**



**Consolidated Summary**

## Table of content

1	General information .....	3
1.1	Venue .....	3
1.2	Participation .....	3
1.3	Timetable and organizational modalities .....	3
1.4	Agenda .....	5
2	Summary of the opening ceremony .....	9
3	Reports by session rapporteurs .....	12
3.1	Session 1: The implementation of OSCE tolerance-related commitments in the participating States and the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation, and lessons learned	12
3.2	Session 2: Promoting respect for cultural and religious diversity and facilitating dialogue in the OSCE participating States and the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation .....	14
3.3	Session 3: Countering discrimination in the OSCE participating States and the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation .....	15
4	Summary of the closing session .....	18
5	Recommendations and suggestions emanating from the 2007 Mediterranean Seminar .....	20
6	List of participants .....	21
7	List of documents .....	30
8	Seating arrangement .....	31
9	Annex .....	32

## **1 General information**

### **1.1 Venue**

The Seminar was held from 18 to 19 December 2007, at the Hilton Hotel in Tel Aviv, Israel.

### **1.2 Participation<sup>\*)</sup>**

1.2.1 Thirty-four OSCE participating States, including Portugal/EU, and the European Commission, took part in the Seminar.

1.2.2 Three Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation (Egypt, Israel and Jordan) and three of the Asian Partners for Co-operation (Japan, Korea and Thailand) were represented.

1.2.3 The OSCE Secretariat, the ODIHR, the Office of the OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media, and the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly were represented. Two Personal Representatives of the OSCE Chairman-in-Office also participated.

1.2.4 The international organizations were represented by the Council of Europe and the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees.

1.2.5 65 representatives of various non-governmental organizations (NGOs) were able to attend and to contribute to the Seminar and the preceding NGO side-event, in accordance with the relevant OSCE provisions and practices.

### **1.3 Timetable and organizational modalities**

1.3.1 The Seminar began at 9.15 a.m. (opening ceremony) on 18 December and ended at 1 p.m. on 19 December 2007.

1.3.2 The Seminar was conducted in three sessions.

1.3.3 The opening session was chaired by Ambassador Sanchez de Boado, Head of the Spanish Delegation to the OSCE, Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council. The closing session was chaired by Ambassador Antti Turunen, Head of the Finnish Delegation to the OSCE, Chairperson of the Contact Group with the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation.

1.3.4 Each session had a moderator and a rapporteur.

1.3.5 In accordance with PC.DEC/808, a side-event with NGOs was held on the eve of the Seminar.

1.3.6 A report of the side-event was presented before the start of the first session.

1.3.7 The working language was English. At the request of several participating States interpretation was provided from and into French.

---

<sup>\*)</sup> See chapter 6, List of participants

- 1.3.8 Arrangements were made for press coverage.
- 1.3.9 Other rules of procedure and working methods of the OSCE were applied, *mutatis mutandis*, to the Seminar.
- 1.3.10 The seating arrangement is shown in chapter 8.

## 1.4 Agenda

**Monday, 17 December**

NGO event

**Tuesday, 18 December 2007**

8.30–9.15 a.m. Registration of participants

9.15–10 a.m. Opening ceremony

Chairperson:

**H.E. Ambassador Carlos Sanchez de Boado**, Chairman of the OSCE Permanent Council

Statements by:

**H.E. Mr. Majalli Whbee**, MK, Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs of Israel

**H.E. Ambassador Carlos Sanchez de Boado**, Chairman of the OSCE Permanent Council

**H.E. Ambassador Antti Turunen**, Chairperson of the Contact Group with the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation

**H.E. Amb. Marc Perrin de Brichambaut**, OSCE Secretary General

**H.E. Ambassador Christian Strohal**, Director of ODIHR

10–10.30 a.m. Coffee break

10.30–10.45 a.m. Report of the Chairperson of the NGO side event

10.45 a.m.–12.45 p.m. **Session 1: The implementation of OSCE tolerance-related commitments in the participating States and the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation and lessons learned**

Moderator: **H.E. Ambassador Yusuf Buluç**, Turkey

Rapporteur: **Mr. Alastair Long**, United Kingdom

This session will focus on:

— Implementation of OSCE tolerance-related commitments in the participating States and the

Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation and lessons learned;

- The role of women relating to the implementation of OSCE commitments in the field of tolerance and non-discrimination;
- Uptake by the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation of ODIHR's tools and assistance programmes developed to support OSCE participating States in implementing their commitments.

#### Speakers

- **Ms. Colette Avital MK**, Head of the Knesset delegation to the OSCE-PA
- **Ms. Edith Schlaffer**, Women without Borders
- **Commander Dov Lutzky**, expert on tolerance-related aspects of community policing
- **Ms. Jo-Anne Bishop**, Senior Adviser, ODIHR

#### Discussion

Conclusions and remarks by the moderator

12.45–2.30 p.m.

Lunch at the *Cafe Med*, Hilton Hotel, hosted by the OSCE Secretariat

3–5 p.m.

### **Session 2: Promoting respect for cultural and religious diversity and facilitating dialogue in the OSCE participating States and the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation**

Moderator: **H.E. Ambassador Bertrand de Crombrughe**, Belgium

Rapporteur: **Mr. Marco Sermoneta**, Israel

This session will focus on:

- The role of formal education as a means of combating intolerance, stereotyping and misunderstanding and the additional contribution by civil society and academia;
- Other educational tools and means, such as informal and extra-curricular tools to promote mutual respect and understanding among all segments of society;
- The role of media in facilitating mutual respect and understanding and in countering misperceptions and prejudices.

Speakers

- **H.E. Ambassador Julie Finley**, U.S.A
- **Mr. Mark Weitzman** Simon Wiesenthal Center
- **Prof. Javier Martínez-Torrón and Mr. Jeremy Gunn**,  
ODIHR Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion  
or Belief

Discussant

- **H.E. Ambassador Ömür Orhun**, Personal Representative  
of the OSCE Chairman-in-Office on Combating Intolerance  
and Discrimination against Muslims

Discussion

Conclusions and remarks by the moderator

19.00

Dinner hosted by the Foreign Minister of Israel

**Wednesday, 19 December 2007**

9.30–11.30 a.m.

Session 3: Countering discrimination in the OSCE  
participating States and the Mediterranean Partners for  
Co-operation

Moderator: **The Hon. Alcee L. Hastings**, President  
Emeritus of the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly

Rapporteur: **Mr. Peter Hulený**, Slovakia

This session will focus on countering:

- Discrimination and the manifestations of racism and  
xenophobia towards migrants, in line with the OSCE  
Ministerial Council statement on migration  
(MC.DOC/6/06);
- Discrimination against women;
- Other forms of discrimination, on the basis of OSCE  
commitments, including the MC.DEC/04/03<sup>1</sup>.

---

<sup>1</sup> MC.DEC/04/03 on the Tolerance and Non-Discrimination, inter alia, said that: “Reaffirming its commitment to promote tolerance and combat discrimination, and its concern about all manifestations of aggressive nationalism, racism, chauvinism, xenophobia, anti-Semitism and violent extremism in all participating States, as well as discrimination based, inter alia, on race, color, sex, language, religion or belief, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status.” “Affirms the importance of freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief, and condemns all discrimination and violence, including against any religious group or individual believer [...]”

### Speakers

- **H.E. Ambassador Stanislav Raščan**, Slovenia
- **H.E. Ambassador Lars-Erik Lundin**, European Commission
- **Ms. Gali Etzion**, NAAMAT Movement of Working Women and Volunteers

### Discussant

- **Prof. Gert Weisskirchen**, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairman-in-Office on Combating anti-Semitism

### Discussion

Conclusions and remarks by the moderator

11.30 a.m.–12.00 noon

Coffee break

12 noon–1 p.m.

Concluding session

Chairperson: **H.E. Ambassador Antti Turunen**, Chairperson of the Contact Group with the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation

Reports by session rapporteurs

Discussion and assessment of the OSCE Mediterranean dialogue

Concluding statement by **H.E. Ambassador Dan Ashbel**, Permanent Representative of the State of Israel to the OSCE

Concluding statement by **H.E. Mr. Jose Angel Lopez Jorin**, Head of the OSCE Chairmanship Task Force

12.45–2.30 p.m.

Lunch at the *Cafe Med*, Hilton Hotel, hosted by the OSCE Secretariat and Israel

2.30.00 p.m.

End of Seminar



## 2 Summary of the opening ceremony

### *Report by Fabrizio Scarpa, Senior External Co-operation Officer, OSCE Secretariat*

The opening session was chaired by H.E. Ambassador Carlos Sánchez de Boado, Chairman of the OSCE Permanent Council, who also delivered the opening statement on behalf of the Chairman-in-Office. The ceremony also saw addresses by H.E. Mr. Majalli Wahabee, MK, Deputy Minister for Foreign Affairs of Israel; H.E. Ambassador Antti Turunen, Chairperson of the Contact Group with the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation, H.E. Ambassador Marc Perrin de Brichambaut, OSCE Secretary General, and H.E. Ambassador Christian Strohal, Director of the ODIHR.

In his address, the host, Deputy Foreign Minister Wahabee, welcomed the participants to Israel and stressed the importance for the Mediterranean region of the core subjects of the Seminar, namely, combating intolerance and discrimination and promoting mutual respect and understanding. He recalled the Secretary General's statement at the Madrid Ministerial Conference that "at the heart of the OSCE approach to security is the principle that security starts with the inherent dignity of the human person." The OSCE Mediterranean dialogue allowed the OSCE to share its experience with the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation in areas such as confidence-building, creating a platform for dialogue and fostering of norms and behaviour, the security model for the twenty-first century and new threats to security and stability, and migration and integration policies.

He expressed regret at the absence of some Mediterranean Partners, calling for a cessation in the use of international forums for pointing fingers at Israel and indulging in the kind of point-scoring that only served to slow down confidence-building in the Mediterranean. He also called on the Mediterranean Partners to publicly condemn the forces of hatred and violence that, ultimately, undermine everything they stand for.

Referring to the conference in Annapolis, Mr Wahabee mentioned the peacemaking effort indicating the vision of a new Israeli-Palestinian solution on the basis of two peacefully coexisting States. Finally, he highlighted the hope the partnership brought, based as it is on equality, human rights and democracy, especially with regard to global problems requiring international co-operation. To conclude, Mr Wahabee expressed the wish that the Seminar would be successful and serve to bring the OSCE and its Mediterranean partners closer together.

On behalf of the Chairman-in-Office, H.E. Miguel Angel Moratinos, Ambassador Carlos Sánchez de Boado thanked the host government for its hospitality and dialogue efforts. He stressed the Spanish Chairmanship's determination to foster the growth of interaction with the Mediterranean Partners. He highlighted the relations between and mutual interests shared by the northern and southern shores of the Mediterranean, whose security was inseparable. Ambassador Sánchez de Boado expressed the hope that all Mediterranean countries would join the OSCE in working for a safer world. Regarding the OSCE meetings, he drew particular attention to Spain's work to allow the Partners to be treated equally to the participating States and sit at the same table at OSCE meetings. He recalled the many initiatives Spain had launched and supported during the year, from the Cordoba conference to the Youth Forum, from the translation into Arabic of the Handbook on migration to the publication of the Toledo Guiding Principles, and from the Madrid declaration on the Partners for Co-operation to the establishment of the Partnership Fund. In this context, he

called for an ever stronger political will to strengthen relations with the Mediterranean Partners.

Turning to the fight against intolerance, he noted that it could only be won through working together dispassionately and without violent reactions, and through guiding people by educating them on the importance of respect for one's fellow human being, regardless of beliefs. Victory could be achieved through a true alliance of civilizations and cultures.

In conclusion, Ambassador de Boado expressed satisfaction at the substantial presence of NGOs and other representatives from civil society, and referred to the side-event for NGOs that had taken place on the eve of the Seminar.

Ambassador Turunen, Chairman of the Mediterranean Contact Group, thanked Israel for its warm hospitality and for hosting the Seminar. He also welcomed the participants, while at the same time regretting that some Partner States had decided not to take part. He noted that tolerance and non-discrimination had particular importance for Finland and expressed satisfaction that the Finnish proposal to choose these matters as the theme of the Seminar had been accepted. He emphasized Finland's commitment to enhancing co-operation with the OSCE Partner States during its OSCE Chairmanship in 2008 through pragmatic steps on the basis of the Madrid Declaration and the decision on the Partnership Fund. Finland had hoped that the Seminar would provide an opportunity to enhance dialogue among the Mediterranean Partners, and between the Partners and the participating States, on tolerance-related issues. He regretted that the political situation in the eastern Mediterranean had prevented relations from being enhanced as much as had been intended. Nevertheless, he hoped that the difficulties of 2007 would remain an exception.

He noted that the adoption of a joint declaration at the Euro-Mediterranean Ministerial Meeting in November 2006 reflected the extent to which Mediterranean States were willing to use regional platforms to forge closer ties with regional partners. Although the OSCE was not involved directly in the peace process in the region, efforts should continue to be made to look for windows of opportunity for fostering dialogue and sharing the OSCE norms, principles and commitments with the Mediterranean Partners.

In conclusion, he noted that the time had come to accelerate the exploration of new avenues in the quest to give true meaning to the concept of partnership, and stated his hope that the Seminar would serve as a stepping stone towards the realization of this aim.

The Secretary General noted that the reason why tolerance and non-discrimination were key questions was that the security of States could only be built on respect for the security of each individual citizen. Discriminatory practices, marginalization, exclusion and non-integration could lead to anger and also undermine the richness and diversity of societies. Conversely, integrating diversity while strengthening common values was one of the most important tasks in the implementation of the values shared by OSCE participating States.

He added that the OSCE's approach was wide and was articulated at many levels. First of all, the OSCE provided a political forum where 56 countries with different cultures, religions and histories could come together to clarify and define amongst themselves the basic principles of tolerance and non-discrimination. The ability and willingness of the participating States to continue pursuing dialogue even in the face of situations of crisis constituted one of the keystones of the Organization and one that was also of particular relevance in the context of

the Mediterranean dialogue. Secondly, the OSCE had been provided with the essential tools to assist participating States build their capacity to implement their human dimension commitments. A third important contribution lay in the Organization's monitoring and reporting activities, also known as peer review.

In conclusion, he referred to the establishment of the Partnership Fund, noting that he would soon be circulating its operational modalities and calling for contributions from participating States and Partner States alike. The Fund would be an important tool for the financing of events such as the NGO side-event that took place on the eve of the Seminar.

Ambassador Strohal outlined the ODIHR's co-operation on countering anti-Semitism with various institutions, such as the Yad Vashem and the Stephen Roth Institute. He also thanked the Citizens' Accord Forum for its invaluable support in organizing the side-event for Mediterranean NGOs that had taken place on the eve of the Seminar. He noted that the recommendations stemming from the side-event underlined the importance of co-operation and continued collaboration between the civil society sectors of participating States and Partner States.

As for tolerance and non-discrimination, they had emerged as clear OSCE priorities in the last five years, with numerous decisions and more than ten OSCE high-level conferences and implementation meetings being devoted to this topic, including the last two OSCE Mediterranean Seminars.

He also highlighted the ODIHR's new tools in this field, such as the Guiding Principles on Teaching about Religions and Beliefs in Public Schools and the new country-specific Handbooks on Muslims Communities. As for gender equality, he noted that one of the barriers to achieving gender equality is that women's organizations and gender-equality mechanisms are often isolated from mainstream democracy development. He highlighted the ODIHR's role in providing assistance to OSCE participating States, in implementing their commitments related to the promotion of gender equality, and in increasing the participation of women in governance structures, stating that the ODIHR would welcome requests for assistance in this area from Mediterranean Partners.

In conclusion, he announced that the ODIHR was the process of translating its Human Dimension Commitments publication into Arabic, in the hope that it will contribute to increased awareness of the commitments amongst the Mediterranean Partners and also to their increased collaboration with the ODIHR (including civil society).

### **3 Reports by session rapporteurs**

#### **3.1 Session 1: The implementation of OSCE tolerance-related commitments in the participating States and the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation, and lessons learned**

##### *Report by Mr. Alastair Long, United Kingdom*

Session 1 looked at the implementation of OSCE commitments on tolerance, including its commitments related to the role of women. It also reviewed the lessons learned through implementation, the assistance tools developed by the OSCE, and the use of the latter by the Partners for Co-operation.

The Moderator introduced discussion, emphasizing that the core of the tolerance debate was the understanding that human dignity required equal respect for the human rights of all individuals. He drew participants' attention to the commitment of the 1999 Istanbul Summit that participating States are accountable to their citizens and to each other for the implementation of their commitments, and argued that while the OSCE had enjoyed many opportunities for important debate, the political will was lacking to ensure their full implementation.

Stressing the importance of debate, keynote speaker Ms. Colette Avital of the Knesset said that the first tool in promoting tolerance was communication. In this connection, she regretted the absence of some of the Mediterranean Partners and hoped for the further development of dialogue within the Mediterranean Partnership structure.

Avital outlined work being done to promote tolerance towards women in Israel. The legislative framework had been strengthened with such aims as reducing the gap in salaries between men and women, promoting women's health, increasing the number of women in decision-making forums (including those at the local level), and combating violence against women. Israel was one of very few countries to have put UNSCR 1325 into domestic law, and was committed to ensuring that women participate in peace negotiations.

In support, keynote speaker Edith Schlaffer of the NGO Women without Borders argued that women were effective agents of soft power. They were equipped with excellent communication skills and could be instrumental in reaching out to and developing understanding with marginalized groups, including Europe's Muslim communities.

The need for an enhanced understanding of cultural and religious diversity in society was stressed by a number of speakers. This understanding might avert the risk of marginal groups feeling that their voices were going unheard, and prevent some members of Muslim communities from feeling trapped in a vacuum between Western and Islamic traditional identities. Schlaffer hoped that, with understanding, the fear of some Muslim men that women might become too westernized could be overcome, thus enabling women to play more of a role in transforming society. Another speaker noted that cultural diversity should not be used as an excuse for ignoring fundamental human rights.

Keynote speaker Commander Dov Lutzky, sharing his experience of community policing programmes in Israel, underlined the importance for security of building understanding

between communities. Following riots in Israel in 2000, the police had been forced to re-examine their relationship with the public and strengthen the community partnership through the establishment of a network of community police centres. They had increased minority recruitment, had introduced core values education, and had focused on improving understanding of cultural and religious traditions to building bonds calculated to help reduce tensions.

Avital identified a possible tension between whether to adopt an approach of imposing values on marginal groups or of encouraging the incorporation of their values and systems of education. She believed that education was a critical tool for ensuring that children grew up understanding the value of pluralism. Schlaffer and others noted that there was also a need for the educated to remain open-minded. Selective hearing was far too prevalent. Listening was a skill and it was important to engage articulate, self-questioning people.

Lutzky argued that it was important to educate all sectors of society in the values of others, and not to focus only on the marginal communities. He hoped that the Israeli experience of community policing might be of benefit to police services internationally and looked forward to increased international co-operation. Keynote speaker Jo-Anne Bishop of the OSCE/ODIHR picked up on this and advertised the recent establishment of a network of policing experts from OSCE participating States to exchange information on hate crime and on strategies for tackling the phenomenon.

Bishop provided an overview of ODIHR tools developed to assist participating States. She outlined the ODIHR's role in collecting data, monitoring, and reporting on hate crime and invited the Partners for Co-operation to submit statistics and nominate national contact points. She explained that the ODIHR, while recognizing the specificity of the different forms of intolerance, had developed tools in four cross-cutting areas: education, legislative assistance, law enforcement training, and civil society capacity-building. Reviewing developments, Bishop noted: the recent launch of the Toledo guiding principles on teaching about religion and belief in public schools; a pilot scheme to produce a compendium of teacher training materials in Azerbaijan; law enforcement training courses recently implemented in three OSCE participating States; and the successful NGO meeting preceding the Seminar. She hoped that such meetings would become a permanent feature of the Mediterranean seminars and also called for increased participation by the Partners for Co-operation in the regular human dimension meetings. She concluded by drawing participants' attention to the TANDIS online information system, a rich fund of useful information, statistics and practical initiatives.

The Moderator concluded the session by urging the Partners for Co-operation to make maximum use of the tools made available through the partnership structure.

### **3.2 Session 2: Promoting respect for cultural and religious diversity and facilitating dialogue in the OSCE participating States and the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation**

*Report by Mr. Marco Sermoneta, Israel*

Session 2 was devoted to promoting respect for cultural and religious diversity and facilitating dialogue in the OSCE participating States and the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation.

In the first keynote speech, Ambassador Julie Finley of the United States described the pivotal role of the classroom, both on the formal and on the informal level, in raising more tolerant generations, while also drawing attention to the opportunities that education presents for parents as well as for children. Ms. Finley also made reference to the role that free media can play in promoting open debate in society. Finally, she turned her attention to the Partners for Co-operation, suggesting that the United States could help them to establish offices that would focus on the themes of tolerance and mutual understanding and operate lending libraries.

Mr. Mark Weizman of the Simon Wiesenthal Centre shared his organization's initiative in endeavouring to lift, to use his own words, the "veil of ignorance" contributing to the violence in the world today by using the Internet, the very tool that is so popular among the agents of radicalization and extremism, for positive purposes. The intention behind the launching of the website AskMusa.org in Arabic, Indonesian, Urdu, and Farsi was to bridge the knowledge gap and to correct harmful stereotypes of Jews inside the Muslim world with a view to breaking down the ignorance that fuels extremism.

Prof. Martinez-Torron and Mr. Gunn, of the ODIHR Advisory Panel on Freedom of Religion or Belief, spoke in detail on the Toledo Guiding Principles on Teaching about Religions and Beliefs in Public Schools. The speakers highlighted the significance of basing the TGP on a human rights perspective and the fact that state neutrality can be achieved in teaching about religions or beliefs. Specific attention was also drawn to the importance of curricula based on sound scholarship; of teachers being appropriately trained for this task, with respect being paid to their own beliefs; and to the participation of all relevant stakeholders.

The discussion part of the session opened with remarks by Ambassador Omur Orhun, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairman-in-office on Combating Intolerance and Discrimination against Muslims. Ambassador Orhun put forward thoughts on the concepts most prominent in the speakers' interventions – diversity, tolerance, and dialogue – and on questions regarding legislation and the "politics of identity". This generated a lively debate on the floor, with interventions making references to the experience and activities of different States in promoting tolerance and mutual understanding, both domestically and internationally; to the importance of involving the civil society in the seminar; to the responsibility and moral role of the media; and to the issue of "global identity".

### **3.3 Session 3: Countering discrimination in the OSCE participating States and the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation**

#### *Report by Mr. Peter Hulényi, Slovakia*

Session 3 was devoted to various aspects of countering discrimination, and focused particularly on three subtopics: discrimination and manifestations of racism and xenophobia towards migrants, in line with the OSCE Ministerial Council statement on migration; discrimination against women; and other forms of discrimination, on the basis of OSCE commitments. The issues were introduced by the Slovenian ambassador, Mr. Stanislav Raščan, by the European Commission ambassador, Mr. Lars Erik Lundin, and by the NAAMAT lawyer Ms. Gali Etzion. Moderator of the session was the Hon. Alcee L. Hastings, president emeritus of the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly, who provided participants with introductory remarks.

Ambassador Raščan delivered a comprehensive presentation, emphasizing that although various aspects of countering discrimination had only reached public awareness in the last few years, the OSCE had been paying attention to these issues for much longer. He pointed out that in order to combat discrimination it was first of all necessary to define this phenomenon. He offered the definition that discrimination was giving one person preferential treatment over another on the basis of sex, racial or ethnic origin, religion or belief, disability, age, or sexual orientation. In the second part of his presentation Mr. Raščan made a distinction between countering discrimination and countering the manifestation of discrimination. In his opinion, manifestations of discrimination were properly countered through legal measures, whereas discrimination itself was countered by changing mentalities and providing education, in particular to young people. Mr. Raščan pointed out the links between these two activities.

Finally he outlined the role OSCE could play in this area, both for the participating States and for the Partners for Co-operation. At the OSCE, States could learn from each other by exchanging ideas and best practices. The OSCE also provided a neutral forum for the Mediterranean Partners to enhance dialogue and co-operation through the Contact Group and OSCE events. He expressed the view that the know-how and expertise of the OSCE should serve not just the participating States, but also the Partners and others subscribing to the OSCE's common values. Mr. Raščan quoted one concrete example of the OSCE making a contribution in this respect, namely, the Handbook on Establishing Effective Labour Migration Policies in Countries of Origin and Destination. The Arabic translation of this handbook had been presented at the Seminar.

Ambassador Lundin focused his presentation on the European Union's activities in the area of combating discrimination. Firstly he described EU activities in countering discrimination in general, mentioning legislative measures, action plans, programmes, financial resources, and concrete activities. Particularly, he gave information about two pieces of European legislation (the Racial Equality Directive and the Employment Framework Directive) and the new integrated programme for 2007–2013 (Programme for Employment and Social Solidarity). He provided participants with examples of EU activities in this area ranging from giving lawyers and judges training on European equality legislation to empowering NGOs to support or represent victims of discrimination.

In the second part of his presentation, Mr. Lundin discussed EU action against racism and xenophobia. In this context he mentioned two new initiatives: the establishment in Vienna in early 2007 of the EU Fundamental Rights Agency, and the Framework Decision on Combating Racism and Xenophobia agreed upon in April 2007. He pointed out that Roma had been identified as one of the most vulnerable groups. In the third part of his presentation, Mr. Lundin described EU policy towards migrants, and in the fourth part EU policy on combating discrimination against women. He provided the audience with one interesting sample of statistical data that provoked a lively discussion. In the last part of his presentation, Mr. Lundin presented EU external policies in the area of combating discrimination, mentioning co-operation with the United Nations and the OSCE and political dialogues with third countries, for example, Russia and China.

Ms. Gali Etzion focused in her presentation on issues related to combating discrimination against women. She emphasized that the problems were universal and concerned all Partners or participating States, and shared with participants some critical facts about the current situation in Israel. The prevalence of religious laws caused certain specific problems. Tension between the civil and religious courts was a source of problems for the implementation of family law. At the same she gave a positive account of existing tools for combating discrimination and of an existing and well established legal framework in Israel. She stressed while the legal framework was important, its implementation was essential.

Discussion was opened by Prof. Gert Weisskirchen, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairman-in-Office on Combating anti-Semitism. He had profound thoughts and ideas to communicate to the participants. He expressed the view that the only way for society to survive was to follow the path from ideology to identity to individuality. Mr. Weisskirchen highlighted three main types of conflict between human beings and their fellow citizens and suggested that in constitutional democratic societies it was possible to respond to all three types of conflict in such a way that their inherent destructive potential would be defused. He pointed out that the core of freedom consisted in individual human beings making their own decisions about the building blocks of their own identity. The wider the range of opportunities open to human beings for integration into a particular society, the more likely they were to succeed in their search for a self-determined identity. Finally he underlined the necessity of dialogue between governments, parliaments, and NGOs if citizens were to be given the opportunity to increase their level of participation.

In his intervention, Rabbi Andrew Baker briefly offered his own assessment of the Seminar. He considered the non-participation by three OSCE Mediterranean Partners as a failure. On the other hand, he appreciated the side-event with NGOs, which could serve as a precedent for future seminars. He expressed his hope that in the following year there would be real dialogue both on the NGO and on the governmental level. His thoughts were commented upon by a number of participants. One ambassador asked for a greater sense of proportion in the presenting and assessing of good practices and achievements. A second ambassador suggested that Rabbi Baker might tone down his assessment of the Seminar and asked for more patience. Several participants elaborated on the statistical data on discrimination of women provided by Ambassador Lundin. Grass roots contacts and foreign assistance were also highlighted. Two participants shared the experiences of their respective countries in the area of countering discrimination. Alan Schneider, director of the B'nai B'rith World Center in Jerusalem, noted that some preparations for the Durban Review Conference were already under way. The NGO preparatory forum that took place as part of the "Durban Conference"



had been plagued by virulent anti-Semitic and anti-Israel rhetoric. He expressed the wish of his organization that any Durban Review Conference should be free of these fatal flaws. To help ensure this, he called upon the OSCE participating States, particularly those represented on the Preparatory Committee for the Durban Review Conference (Armenia, Croatia, Estonia, Russian Federation, Belgium, Greece, Norway, and Turkey), to insist that OSCE principles – in particular its working definition of anti-Semitism – become controlling principles at any future Durban Review Conference.

## 4 Summary of the closing session

### *Report by Fabrizio Scarpa, Senior External Co-operation Officer, OSCE Secretariat*

The closing session was chaired by H.E. Ambassador Antti Turunen, Chairperson of the Contact Group with the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation. Concluding remarks were delivered by H.E. Ambassador Jose Angel Lopez Jorin, Head of the Task Force for the 2007 Spanish OSCE Chairmanship, and by H.E. Ambassador Dan Ashbel, Permanent Representative of the State of Israel to the OSCE.

Ambassador Turunen underlined the importance of the Seminar being held in Israel for the first time since 1996 and thanked the host country for its excellent hospitality and for its continued commitment to working with the OSCE. He also thanked the representatives of Egypt and Jordan for their presence, despite the Muslim festivity of Eid Al-Adha. He expressed satisfaction at the NGO event on the eve of the Seminar, hoping that similar events would also be organized at future seminars. He recalled the difficulties in the negotiations concerning the location of the 2007 Seminar, and noted that a seminar with limited participation was still better than no seminar at all.

In his closing remarks, Ambassador Ashbel thanked the CIO for taking the decision to hold the Mediterranean Seminar in Israel. He also thanked Ambassador Turunen for his ongoing efforts in leading the Mediterranean Contact Group in a turbulent year. He noted that throughout the seminar all Israeli speakers had pointed out Israel's commitment to the OSCE as an organization and to the values it represented. He regretted what he described as different levels of commitment to partnership with the OSCE amongst its members, referring in particular to the lack of attendance by some Mediterranean Partners and the low level of participation by those who chose to participate. He remarked that the OSCE Mediterranean dialogue was but a tool intended to enhance understanding, to further dialogue, and to promote mutual respect, and that it was not enough to point fingers at others and blame them for intolerance against Muslims and Islam. All had to look into their own backyards and fight prejudices, lack of human rights, and intolerance. On the positive side, the Seminar had provided an opportunity to listen to women and men who were involved and committed to improving the relations between people and peoples, to witness genuine efforts to promote mutual understanding, and to learn about programmes and projects that all had one thing in common: the goal of making our societies ones in which all will feel comfortable. In conclusion, he expressed the hope that future dialogue on these issues will see greater involvement on the part of the other Mediterranean Partners.

Ambassador Lopez Jorin noted that 2007 had been a challenging year, but also a very rich one in the human dimension. He recalled the Bucharest Conference, the Cordoba Conference and the Youth Forum, all of which were mainly devoted to the subject of tolerance and non-discrimination. In the human dimension, the Spanish Chairmanship had set as one of its main priorities "diversity and participation in pluralistic societies". He quoted one of the statements made at the Seminar: "Tolerance is a code name for democracy – nothing more, nothing less ..."

Two aspects of the 2007 Mediterranean Seminar had been particularly important. For the first time, a side-event with NGOs had been held, which brought a breath of fresh air to debate and a wealth of recommendations and ideas on how to promote tolerance and non-discrimination, both in the participating States and, most importantly, in the Mediterranean

Partners themselves. He noted that NGOs had an important role to play in fighting intolerance, precisely because of their energy and determination and their day-to-day connection with society. They could be effective as educators, promoters of values, and as lobbyists with diplomats and governments. Their recommendations were particularly rich in substance and should be studied carefully as a source of inspiration for future endeavours. Secondly, he highlighted the emphasis with which it had been made clear that political will remained the cornerstone for any advance in the implementation of the OSCE's principles and commitments.

In conclusion, he noted the nature of OSCE as a forum for dialogue, pointing out that the difficulties encountered in the Tel Aviv seminar with respect to full participation, and to the goal of bringing about really meaningful dialogue, should stimulate reflection on the need to intensify efforts to live up to the hopes entertained and the goals established in Helsinki in 1975.

## **5 Recommendations and suggestions emanating from the 2007 Mediterranean Seminar**

*Compiled by Fabrizio Scarpa, Senior External Co-operation Officer, OSCE Secretariat, in consultation with the Finnish Chairmanship of the Mediterranean Contact Group and the host country.*

- Encourage increased participation by the Mediterranean Partners in human dimension events
- Increase civil society involvement in OSCE Mediterranean Seminars and organize NGO events in conjunction with future Mediterranean Seminars
- Partners for Co-operation to make full use of the ODIHR toolbox to counter intolerance and discrimination
- Partners for Co-operation to take advantage of the ODIHR's TANDIS online information system, notably by providing information on legislation and statistics, and summaries of good practices
- Assist the creation in the countries of the Partners for Co-operation of centres for the promotion of tolerance and non-discrimination, and lending libraries on this subject
- Increase focus on the implementation, and not just adoption, of legal instruments
- Spread the Toledo Guiding Principles and promote their use in schools
- Promote the education of all sectors of society in the values of others, avoiding focusing only on marginal communities
- Pay attention to the need for the educated sector of society to remain open-minded
- Enhance understanding of cultural and religious diversity in society as a means of promoting the feeling of belonging among marginal groups
- Adopt a holistic approach to education, addressing such matters as civic education and issues of identity; teaching under-privileged groups about their rights (getting rid of identity vacuums); cross-cultural education on the history of humanity; media literacy training (exposure to electronic media); training of teachers, law enforcement officials, clergy and imams, and also parents
- Increase awareness in the more traditional segments of society of the potential role of women in the transformation of society
- Police forces to aim to improve their understanding of cultural and religious traditions in order to build bonds that may reduce tensions
- Increase participation in the existing police expert networks aimed at exchanging information on hate crimes and strategies against them
- Participating States and Partners for Co-operation involved in the Durban Review Conference to promote the use of the OSCE's working definition of anti-Semitism

## 6 List of participants

### Germany

Dr. Axel Berg  
Ambassador, Head of Permanent Mission of Germany to the OSCE

### United States of America

Ms. Julie Finley  
Ambassador, Head of the United States Mission to the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe

Mr. Alcee L. Hastings  
Member of US Congress, United States Delegation to the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly, President Emeritus, Special Representative on Mediterranean Affairs

Mr. David Goldenberg  
Chief of Staff for Congressman Alcee L. Hastings

Ms. Marlene Kaufmann  
General Counsel, US Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe

### Austria

Dr. Margit Wästfelt  
Ambassador, Head of the Permanent Mission of Austria to the OSCE

Mr. Tom Wästfelt  
Honorary Consul General of Austria in St. Petersburg, RF

Dr. Edith Kropiunigg-Schlaffer  
Women Without Borders, Chairwoman

Mr. Michael Rendi  
Ambassador to Israel, Embassy in Tel Aviv

Dr. Arad Benkö  
Director of Cultural department, Embassy in Tel Aviv

Mr. Norbert Hack  
Deputy Head of Mission, Embassy in Tel Aviv

### Belarus

Mr. Sergei Rychenko  
Press-Secretary, Embassy, Embassy of the Republic of Belarus to the Israel

### Belgium

Mr. Bertrand De Crombrughe  
Ambassador, Head of the Permanent Delegation of Belgium to the OSCE

Mr. Pascal Heyman  
Deputy Head of the Permanent Delegation of Belgium to the OSCE

### Bulgaria

Mr. Chavdar Zhechev  
Ambassador, Head of the Permanent Delegation of Bulgaria to the OSCE

### Canada

Ms. Barbara Gibson  
Ambassador, Head of the Delegation of Canada to the OSCE

Ms. Lisa Helfand  
Minister-Counsellor, Embassy in Tel Aviv

### Cyprus

Mr. Kornelios Korneliou  
Ambassador, Head of the Permanent Mission of Cyprus to the OSCE

### **Croatia**

Mr. Ivan Del Vechio  
Ambassador, Embassy of the Republic of Croatia to Israel

Ms. Duška Paravić  
Deputy Head of Mission, Embassy of the Republic of Croatia to Israel

### **Denmark**

Mr. Stefan Kovacs  
Head of Section, Ministry of Foreign Affairs in Denmark

### **Spain / OSCE Chairmanship**

Mr. Carlos Sanchez de Boado  
Ambassador, Head of the Permanent Mission of Spain to the OSCE

Mr. Jose Angel Lopez Jorin  
Ambassador, Head of OSCE Chairmanship Task Force

Mr. Arturo Perez Martinez  
Deputy Permanent Representative

Mr. Juan González-Barba  
DCM, Embassy of Spain in Israel

### ***Personal Representatives of the OSCE CiO***

Mr. Omur Orhun  
Ambassador, Personal Representative of the OSCE CiO on Combating Intolerance and Discrimination against Muslims

Prof. Gert Weisskirchen  
Member of the German Parliament, Personal Representative of the CiO of the OSCE on Combating Antisemitism

### **Finland**

Mr. Antti Turunen  
Ambassador, Head of the Permanent Mission of Finland to the OSCE

Mr. Per-Mikael Engberg  
Ambassador, Embassy of Finland in Tel Aviv

Ms. Anu Pulkkinen  
Embassy of Finland in Tel Aviv, Deputy Head of Mission

Ms. Katja Silventoinen  
Second Secretary, Permanent Mission of Finland to the OSCE

### **France**

Mr. Eric Lebedel  
Ambassador, Head of Permanent Representation of France to the OSCE

### **United Kingdom**

Mr. Alastair Long  
Second Secretary/Political, Human Dimension Officer, Head of United Kingdom Delegation to the OSCE

### **Greece**

Ms. Mara Marinaki  
Ambassador, Head of the Permanent Mission of Greece to the OSCE

Mr. Nikolaos Patakias  
Head of OSCE Department MFA, Athens

Mr. Vassiliki Alexandratou  
Press Counsellor, Embassy of Greece in Tel Aviv

### **Ireland**

Mr. Edin O'Leary  
Ambassador, Head of Mission of Ireland to the OSCE

### **Italy**

Mr. Francesco Bascone  
Ambassador, Head of the Permanent Mission of Italy to the OSCE

Mr. Emilio Giribone  
Second Secretary  
OSCE Desk of the General Directorate of Political Affairs, MFA

### **Lithuania**

Ms. Artūras Melianas  
Deputy county governor, The Administration of Vilnius County

Mr. Rasa Paliukiene  
Department of National Minorities and Lithuanians Living Abroad under the Lithuania Republic Government, Head of the Division of National Minorities

### **Malta**

Mr. Christopher Grima  
Ambassador, Head of Delegation of Malta to the OSCE

### **Montenegro**

Mr. Vladimir Radulović  
Political Director of the MFA of Montenegro

Ms. Mirna Nikčević  
Chief of Staff of the Political Director of the MFA of Montenegro

### **Norway**

Ms. Lene Lind  
DCM Minister Counsellor, Embassy of Norway in Tel Aviv

Mr. Pål Klouman Bekken  
First Secretary, Embassy of Norway in Tel Aviv

### **Netherlands**

Ms. Ida van Veldhuizen  
Ambassador, Head of the Permanent Representation of the Netherlands to the OSCE

### **Poland**

Mr. Marek Szczygiel  
Deputy Head of the Mission to Poland to the OSCE

### **Portugal/EU**

Mr. Paulo Rufino  
OSCE Coordinator, Ministry for Foreign Affairs

### ***European Commission***

Mr. Lars-Erik Lundin  
Ambassador, Head of Delegation of the European Commission to the International Organisations in Vienna

Mr. Alvaro Garcia Navarro  
Third Secretary, EC Delegation in Israel

Ms. Alexandra Meir  
EUPFP Partnership for Peace Task Manager

Mr. Eric Galvin  
Operation Section

Mr. Goncalo Santa Clara Gomes  
Ambassador, Director, Euromesco, Portugal

### **Romania**

Ms. Alina Popescu  
Second Secretary, Permanent Mission of Romania to the OSCE

Ms. Tatiana Iosiper Counsellor, Embassy of Romania in Tel Aviv

### **Russian Federation**

Name tbc Third Secretary, Embassy in Tel Aviv

### **Holy See**

Mr. Anani Nicodemé Barrigah-Benissan Reverend monsignor – Counselor

### **Slovakia**

Mr. Peter Hulenyi Counsellor, Deputy Head of the Permanent Mission of Slovakia to the OSCE

### **Slovenia**

Mr. Stanislav Raščan Ambassador, Head of the Permanent Mission of the Republic Slovenia to the OSCE

### **Sweden**

Mr. Benjamin Escaig First Secretary, Swedish Embassy in Tel Aviv

### **Switzerland**

Mr. Claude Altermatt Minister, Head Section Council of Europe / OSCE, Ministry for Foreign Affairs  
Ms. Monika Schmutz-Kirgoz Embassy of Switzerland in Tel Aviv

### **Czech Republic**

Mr. Daniel Volf III. Secretary of the Embassy of the Czech Republic

### **Turkey**

Mr. Yusuf Buluc Ambassador, Head of the Permanent Mission of Turkey to the OSCE

### **Ukraine**

Mr. Volodymyr Ilarionov First Secretary (political), Embassy of Ukraine in Tel Aviv

## **PARTNERS FOR CO-OPERATION**

### **Japan**

Mr. Mitsuhiro Shinomiya First Secretary, Embassy of Japan in Israel

### **Korea**

Mr. Sung-Hwan Kim Ambassador, Korean Embassy in Vienna  
Mr. Choon-Goo Kim First Secretary, Korean Embassy in Vienna

### **Thailand**

Mr. Adisak Panupong Ambassador, Embassy in Vienna

## **MEDITERRANEAN PARTNERS FOR CO-OPERATION**

### **Egypt**

Mr. Gamal Roshdy Abo Elhassan Third Secretary, Embassy in Tel Aviv

### **Israel**

Mr. Majalli Whbee MK, Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs of Israel

Mr. Rafael Barak Ambassador, Deputy Director General, Head of Europe Division, Ministry of Foreign Affairs



Ms. Colette Avital	MK, Head of the Knesset delegation to the OSCE-PA
Mr. Dan Ashbel	Ambassador, Head of Israeli Delegation to OSCE
Mr. Shemi Tzur	Ambassador, Western Europe Division
Mr. Arie Avidor	Minister Plenipotentiary, Western Europe Division
Ms. Yaffa Ben-Ari	Special Co-ordinator of the OSCE Mediterranean Seminar, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Mr. Sammy Ravel	Director, Department for Multilateral European Institutions, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Ms. Aviva Raz-Shchter	Director, Department for Combating anti-Semitism, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Mr. Boaz Rodkin	Deputy Director, Department for Multilateral European Institutions, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Mr. Haim Assaraf	Deputy Director, Department for Multilateral European Institutions, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Mr. Marco Sermoneta	Department for Multilateral European Institutions, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Mr. Gil Haskel	Head of NGO unit, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Ms. Bruria Harel	Director, Official Guest Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Mr. Shlomi Cohen	Director, Budgeting and Finance, Protocol & Guest Division, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Mr. Moshe Dubiner	Technical Advisor, Communication & Engineering Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Mr. Ya'akov Lavi	Technical Advisor, Communication & Engineering Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Ms. Galit Cohen	Official Guest Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Ms. Gali Etzian	Lawyer in Charge of Special Affairs of NAAMAT – Movement of Working Women & Volunteers
Mr. Zehavit Ben Hillel	Deputy Spokesperson, Deputy Director, Press Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Jerusalem

### **Jordan**

Mr. Asem Ababneh Political Officer

### **OSCE Secretariat**

Mr. Marc Perrin de Brichambaut Secretary General

Dr. Oleksandr Pavlyuk Head of External Co-operation Section

Mr. Fabrizio Scarpa  
Ms. Aldona Szymanski  
Ms. Ghada Studnicka-Hazim

Senior External Co-operation Officer  
Senior External Co-operation Assistant  
Documents Distribution and Meeting  
Support Assistant

### **OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media**

Mr. Arnaud Amouroux

Project Officer

### **Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights**

Dr. Christian Strohal

Ambassador, Director

Ms. Jo-Anne Bishop

Head of Tolerance and Non-Discrimination  
Programme

Ms. Kathrin Meyer

Adviser on Combating Racism, Xenophobia  
and Discrimination Focusing on Combating  
Anti-Semitism

Ms. Anne Giebel

Assistant Project Officer of Tolerance and  
Non-Discrimination Programme

Mr. Maximilian Hennig

Special Adviser to the Director

Mr. Taskin Tankut Soykan

Adviser on Combating Intolerance Against  
Muslims

Ms. Floriane Hohenberg

Adviser on Civil Society Relations

Mr. Mark Weitzman

ODIHR Advisory of Experts on Freedom of  
Belief; Simon Wiesenthal Center

Prof Javier Martinez-Torron

ODIHR Advisory of Experts on Freedom of  
Belief

Mr. Jerremy Gunn

ODIHR Advisory of Experts on Freedom of  
Belief

### **OSCE Parliamentary Assembly**

Mr. Alcee L. Hastings

Member of US Congress, United States  
Delegation, President Emeritus, Special  
Representative on Mediterranean Affairs

### **INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS**

#### **UNHCR**

Mr. Steven Wolfson

Head of Liaison Office, Representation in  
Israel

#### **Council of Europe**

Ms. Gordana Berjan

North-South Centre of the Council of  
Europe, Head of Section, Global Education  
and Youth

#### **Interpreters**

Ms. Ruth Morris

English booth

Ms. Regine Sturm

English booth

Ms. Gisele Abazon

French booth

Ms. Fanny Noskowicz

French booth

### **NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS AND SCIENTIFIC INSTITUTIONS**

Ms. Tamar Alon

American Corner Yaffo , Israel, Director

Mr. Andrew Baker	American Jewish Committee, Director of International Jewish Affairs
Ms. Carole Nuriel	Anti-Defamation League, Arab Affairs Analyst, Israel
Ms. Hamodie Abo Nadda	Anti-Defamation League, Assistant Arab Affairs Analyst, Israel
Ms. Rachel Kedar	Anti-Defamation League, Assistant Director and Coordinator of Educational Programme, Israel
Ms. Arieh O’Sullivan	Anti-Defamation League, Director of Communications, Israel
Ms. Phyllis Gerably	Anti-Defamation League, Managing Director, Israel
Ms. Stacy Burdett	Anti-Defamation League, USA, Associate Director
Mr. Roi Feder	APCO Worldwide, Israel, Associate Director
Ms. Hadas Kaplan	Arab & Jewish Community Center, Deputy Director
Ms. Lana Sirri	Arab & Jewish Community Center, Vocational Training & Community Work Coordinator AJCC
Ms. Rachelle kliger	Arab Affairs Correspondent, The Media Link
Mr. Mohamed Mouha	Association Bennaman pour le Patrimoine et l’Environnement – Morocco, Director
Mr. Ahmed Ajouini	Association Rif Theatre Amazigh, Morocco
Mr. Mohamed Bensaïd	Association Tifaouin Amazigh, Morocco
Mr. Alan Schneider	B’nai B’rith International, Director of the B’nai B’rith World Center
Dr. Oded Avissar	Bet-Yatziv, Director of the National Teachers’ Center for Humanities Study
Ms. Yaira Yasmin	Chief Editor, The Epoch Times
Mr. Ibrahim Abu Shindi	Citizen’a Accord Forum Between Arabs and Jews-Israel, Co-director
Mr. Udi Cohen	Citizen’a Accord Forum Between Arabs and Jews-Israel, Co-director
Ms. Sarah Ozacaky-Lazar	Citizens’ Accord Forum – Israel, Consultant
Ms. Rebecca Zeffert	Citizens’ Accord Forum – Israel, Foreign Media Advisor
Ms. Rahela Dzidic	Civitas Bosnia and Herzegovina, Executive Director
Ms. Ali Fadaul	Commission Preparatoire De L’ass. Amazigh Juive, Observer, Morocco
Ms. Linda Slutzky	Deputy Director, The American Center, Jerusalem
Ms. Anat Reismal Levy	Deputy Director, The citizens' Accord Forum between Jews & Arabs in Israel
Mr. Peleg Reshef	Director, Future Generations Division, World Jewish Congress

Ms. Raya Kalisman	Director, The Center for Humanistic Education
Mr. Ben Adebajo Awe	Dunamis Dunatos, DR
Ms. Alenka Elena Begant	EIP Slovenia – School for Peace, President
Dr. Tobias Schumacher	Euro Mesco
Mr. Xhabir Hamiti	European Muslim Union – Bon, Kosovo representative Lecture at the Faculty of Islamic Studies in Prishtina
Mr. Valery Novoselsky	European Roma Information Office (ERIO) (Israel), External Consultant
Mr. Ahmad Bdair	Givat Haviva
Ms. Shir Epstein	glz
Ms. Irina Merzlykh	Hebrew University in Jerusalem Student
Commander Dov Lutzky	Independent Expert on Tolerance-related Aspects of Community Policing
Mr. Robin Stoller	International Institute for Education and Research on Antisemitism, Director, Germany
Mr. Robin Stoller	International Institute for Education and Research on Antisemitism, Director of the International Institute for Education and Research on Antisemitism, Germany
Ms. Suzette Bronkhorst	Internet Centre Antiracism Europe, General Manager
Mr. Mario Schejtman	Israel Center for Social Justice (Israel), Secretary General
Ms. Judith Recanati	Israel-OSSIM SHALOM –Social Workers for Peace and Welfare, Co-chair person
Mr. Haviv Rettig	Jewish World Correspondent, The Jerusalem Post
Mr. Vanja Hamzic	Logos, Bosnia, President
Ms. Milica Pesic	Media Diversity Institute (UK), Executive Director
Mr. Ahmed Adhirini	Moroccan Amazigh Democratic Party
Ms. Mona Mahagna	Mosaica, Projects' Coordinator, Israel
Mr. Efraim Cohen	NGO
Ms. Elena Mischel	NGO
Ms. Tikva Manhabad	NTD TV
Ms. Miriam Anati	Open Society Institute (Italy)
Ms. Rolly Rosen	Shatil – The New Israel Fund's Empowerment and training Centre, Organizational Consultant
Mr. Haim Altman	Spokesperson and Communications Advisor
Mr. Ronald Eissens	Stichting Magenta / Magenta Foundation, General Director
Mr. Mohammad Darawshe	The Abraham Fund Initiatives, Director of Development and External Relations
Mr. Amnon Be'eri-Sulitzeanu	The Abraham Fund Initiatives, Executive Director, Israel

Ms. Haneen Elias	The Center for humanistic education at The Ghetto fighter house, Facilitator for conflict groups
Mr. Ali Gedikoglu	The Cojep International, President
Mr. Veysel Filiz	The Cojep International, Vice President
Ms. Svetlana Novopolskaja	The Public Institution Roma Community Centre (Lithuania), Director
Ms. Nilly Venezia	Venezia Institute for Differences and Multiculturalism – Israel, Director
Mr. Yariv Nornberg	World Jewish Congress, Israel
Ms. Ariel Rodal	World Jewish Congress, Research Fellow, Israel
Ms. Tammi Molad-Hayo	Consultant & Mediator, Social Justice & Peace
Hadass Teshar	Strategic Communication

## **7 List of documents**

CIO.GAL/191/07	Opening Address by Amb. De Boado, Chairman of the PC
CIO.GAL/194/07	Session 2, Remarks by Amb. Orhun, Personal Representative of the OSCE CiO on Combating Intolerance and Discrimination against Muslims
PC.DEL/1190/07	Opening Address by Mr. Wahabee, Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs of Israel
PC.DEL/1191/07	Opening Statement by Amb. Turunen, Finland
PC.DEL/1192/07	Concluding Remarks of Amb. Ashbel, Israel
PC.DEL/1193/07	Session 3, Speaking Points by Amb. Lundin, European Commission
PC.DEL/1194/07	Session 2, Remarks by Amb. Kim, Republic of Korea
PC.DEL/1195/07	Session 1, The Role of Pro-Active Community Policing in Promoting Tolerance in Diverse Communities by Commander Lutsky
PC.DEL/1196/07	Session 3, Statement by Amb. Raščan, Slovenia
PC.DEL/1197/07	Session 1, Remarks by Ms. Wästfelt, Austria
PC.NGO/70/07	Session 1, Contribution by Ms. Schlaffer, Women without Borders
SEC.DEL/208/07	Letter by Austria with regard to a Booklet on the International Conference "Women Leaders - Networking for Peace and Security in the Middle East"
ODIHR.GAL/104/07	Civil Society Preparatory Meeting, 17 Dec 2007, Recommendations
PC.GAL/236/07/Rev.1	Annotated Agenda of the Seminar and Agenda for the Civil Society Preparatory Meeting
SEC.INF/50/07	Preliminary List of Participants
CIO.GAL/11/08	Concluding Remarks by Amb. Lopez Jorin, Head of the Spanish Task Force

## 8 Seating arrangement

	OSCE Secretariat	Japan
	ODIHR	Korea
	OSCE FOM	Thailand
	CoE	Egypt
	UNHCR	Israel
		Jordan
		Ireland
Italy		
Lithuania		Greece
Malta		United Kingdom
Montenegro		France
Norway		Finland
Netherlands		<i>OSCE CiO Personal Rep</i>
Poland		<i>OSCE CiO Personal Rep</i>
Portugal/EU		Spain / OSCE Chairmanship
<i>European Commission</i>		Denmark
Romania		Croatia
Russian Federation		Cyprus
Holy See		Canada
Slovakia		Bulgaria
Slovenia		Belgium
Sweden		Belarus
Switzerland		Austria
Czech Republic		United States of America
Turkey		Germany
Ukraine		OSCE PA

Rapporteur	OSCE SG
Keynote speakers	Chairperson of Contact Group with MPCs
Moderator	Chairperson
OSCE Secretariat	Host Country
Keynote speakers	CIO Rep.



### **Mediterranean Seminar**

**Combating intolerance and discrimination and promoting mutual respect and understanding**

### **Civil Society Preparatory Meeting**

**Tel Aviv, 17 December 2007**

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

We welcome the opportunity of discussing issues pertaining to combating intolerance and promoting mutual respect and understanding, and of formulating recommendations for the participating States and the Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation as well as for the OSCE institutions.

Regretting that many Mediterranean partner States did not have any NGOs represented at the Seminar, we recommend that the OSCE should facilitate dialogue amongst civil society actors from the OSCE region and from the Mediterranean partner States for co-operation.

### **Working group 1: The role of women in promoting mutual respect and understanding and in countering intolerance and discrimination**

- Having discussed the issue that the mention of religion in constitutions can have negative effects on human rights,
- Noting that economic independence is a prerequisite if women are to become involved in the fight against intolerance,

We make the following recommendations:

#### **To the OSCE**

- To encourage and support women's NGOs and their work in the area of tolerance across the OSCE region and its Mediterranean partner States;
- To facilitate dialogue between women's NGOs and governments.



**To participating States:**

- Take seriously the possibility of opening and continuing dialogue with the Mediterranean partner States about the role of women in society, in particular in the area of promoting mutual respect and understanding;
- We believe that women in high-level political positions can have significant impact on the culture of public debate and on the discourse of human rights, mutual respect and understanding. Therefore, we call upon participating States to involve female leaders in the struggle against intolerance and discrimination by drawing on their knowledge and experience, notably by convening a conference of female leaders committed to the fight against intolerance and discrimination;
- Noting that female leaders are still an exception, we call upon States to create structures, legal instruments and political mechanisms that enable women to get involved in the fight against intolerance and discrimination, notably by ensuring that women are represented in parliaments, governmental institutions and all other official structures;
- Introduce special gender advisors at all levels of government, including the local level, to engage with the causes of gender inequality;
- Introduce liaison officers in Ministries to provide for a constant dialogue with civil society on the issues of tolerance and non-discrimination;
- Take measures to enable women to get involved in improving relations between the majority and minorities;
- Translate the lessons learnt from the fight against gender inequality to the fight against other forms of inequality, notably by facilitating the exchange of experiences of dealing with intolerance and discrimination at all levels of society and also between countries;
- Allocate funding to create special programmes to reach out to girls and women in deprived communities, and that they ensure basic quality education for girls and young women, providing for their access to computers and technology;
- Give priority to gender issues in society in general, particularly in education, to promote respect and mutual understanding;
- Facilitate and support the efforts of women from migrant communities in the OSCE region and the Mediterranean partner States to organize themselves and stand up against patriarchy and discrimination;
- Develop tools to assist migrant women living in two different cultures without obliging them to renounce one of these cultures;
- Integrate religious leaders in the struggle for equal rights for women and encourage them to speak out against oppression and intolerance and for equality;
- Apply the rule of law strictly in any case of bias crime against women and other minorities.

**To civil society:**

- Create and strengthen a network of women's NGOs and support them with tools to work in their own families, communities, schools and social circles to promote mutual respect and understanding;
- Organize joint endeavours in which NGOs may increase the number of women who run for political office and civil society leadership, and support them once they are elected;
- Lead by example by appointing women to high and leading positions in NGOs and by encouraging women to take on high-level positions in civil society, which can also have a significant impact on the culture of public debate and the discourse on human rights;

- Develop programmes to empower migrant women;
- Acknowledge the important role interfaith groups can play in promoting equality;
- We call upon NGOs and governments within the OSCE region and in the Mediterranean Partner States to work with existing networks of women's NGOs who promote the above mentioned-activities, and to use their expertise and networking to expand these ideas.

### **Working group 2: The role of teachers and educators in promoting mutual respect and understanding and in countering intolerance and discrimination**

- States should institutionalize educational programmes designed to combat xenophobia, intolerance and discrimination against Muslims, anti-Semitism, and other forms of intolerance.
- States should develop and implement national human rights education action plans and institutionalize human rights, tolerance, civic, coexistence, democracy, and anti-discrimination education into the formal education system. One model that some States have already agreed to is the UN World HRE program-Action Plan 2005-2008.
- Pre-service and in-service teacher training should be mandatory, to facilitate the delivery of curricula in the above-mentioned areas.
- Promote mutual respect and understanding through teaching about the Holocaust and its roots and universal lessons, and about other genocides,.
- States should integrate the historical narratives of minorities and neighbouring countries into the core curriculum.
- Fight racism in sports: football matches are too often scenes of violence, discrimination and racism. On the whole, however, football and sports can be utilized as an example of non-violence and education for tolerance. We propose launching an all-European-Mediterranean campaign against hate violence through the Champion League and through local football clubs in each country, recruiting players who can serve as role-models for youth and promote tolerance through meeting with children and students, and acting as spokespeople to the media on these issues.
- Gaps in educational opportunities between students of different ethnicities, cultures, religion and economic means are not acceptable. States must integrate students from various sectors in order to expose them to each other and to enrich their education.
- Promote initiatives calculated to encourage positive relationships and understanding among young people and students from different faiths and ethnic and cultural origins (as recommended by the Helsinki Final Act) through international exchanges, internships, meetings, and peer and mentoring programmes.
- States should highlight and fund NGO programmes and training courses on long-term HRE and other anti-discrimination, tolerance, and civic education programmes.
- The Tolerance and non-Discrimination Information System website of the ODIHR should include programmes, reports and best practices from the Mediterranean Partners region.

### **Working group 3: The role of journalists and public personalities in promoting mutual respect and understanding and in countering misperceptions and prejudices**

We have strong concerns about the situation regarding freedom of expression in much of the Mediterranean region.

We therefore urge the OSCE to organize further discussions on these issues, so as to ensure broader regional representation at future meetings.

Some of us further recommend:

- Promoting the positive portrayal of ethnic, religious and other minorities;
- Promoting the participation of prominent editors and journalists in such seminars;
- Encouraging individual OSCE participating States to promote the values of free media in their own bilateral relations with Mediterranean partner States;
- Encouraging newsroom diversity by bringing journalists from different ethnic, religious and cultural backgrounds.